# **Appendix A: Feedback Documentation Templates**

The below templates are for self-reflective feedback documentation and for engaging with colleagues for feedback. The templates are organized by type of feedback and there is a section in each template for additional commentary. Please use whichever template fits your situation.

## **Using the entire Criteria for OER Review**

**Instructions for the reviewer:**

* Please provide honest and constructive feedback using the template below.
* Please provide the template back to the OER Editor by [*Date specified by the OER Editor*] to allow time to reflect on your feedback and implement changes.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Full Criteria for OER Review** | | | |
| **Reviewer Name** | Lynn Kabaroff | **Reviewer Contact** | [Lynn.kabaroff@cambriancollege.ca](mailto:Lynn.kabaroff@cambriancollege.ca) |
| **Reviewer Institutional Affiliation** | Cambrian College | **Reviewer Title** | Professor |
| **Title of OER reviewed** | **Fitness for Paramedics: A Guide for Students at Cambrian College** | | |
| **Link to OER reviewed** | *https://openlibrary.ecampusontario.ca/item-details/#/86b82ca8-d64b-4d6a-b787-fcd1cfa5801d?k=cambrian%20college&itemTypes=6&itemTypes=12&subjects=Health%20Sciences&sortCol=2&increasePopularSearch=true* | | |

# **Rubric**

The below rubric is a modification of the existing Criteria for Open Textbook Review used by the Open Library (adapted from BCcampus). The modifications aim to make the criteria applicable to the broad range of content and formats of OER rather than only open textbooks. New to eCampusOntario is the addendum of criteria for OER that are apps, games, software or XR content.

## **Criteria for OER Review**

For eCampusOntario’s open educational resources (OER) review, you will be prompted to consider the below criteria. You will be asked to give commentary for each criterion and to give an overall scoring on a Likert scale of 1 – 5.

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Quality of OER Content** | | | | | |
| **Comprehensiveness:** The content of the OER covers all areas and ideas of the subject appropriately and provides an effective navigational system through the content (e.g., table of contents, hyperlinks, glossary, title screen, etc.). | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | Subject area are covered well. Introduction/referencing is not organized as well as could be (eg reference not in ‘back matter’) |
| **Content Accuracy**: Content, including supplementary material (e.g., syllabi, test banks, question banks, webpages, etc.), is accurate, error-free, and unbiased. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | Textbook content accurate. Supplemental material are only external websites, some of which is now incorrect or removed |
| **Relevance/Longevity:** Content is up-to-date, but not in a way that will make the content obsolete within a short period of time. The content is presented in such a way that necessary updates will be relatively easy and straightforward to implement. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | Most content up to date. Some weblinks are dated. As this text is used for particular Cambrian courses the mark breakdown is included. This will need to be checked for accuracy as it can move out of date quickly |
| **Clarity:** The content is understandable to the intended audience and provides adequate context for any jargon or technical terminology used. For text, the prose is clear and accessible. For images including graphs and charts, the image is high quality and accurately conveys the intended information. For audio, the sound quality is high, and the content is clearly understandable. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | Text and jargon are good. Very little images: of those images some are charts that are not AODA readable. Unclear if the other images have ALTtext |
| **Consistency:** The content’s terminology and conceptual framework are internally consistent. Note: Some OERs are collaborative efforts among multiple educators, but may be required to streamline into one ‘voice’ unless it was designed to have standalone sections of content (e.g., interviews, individually authored chapters, modules). | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This is a combination of 2 larger OER text + a few pieces from a smaller OER resource + a few pieces from the Cambrian author. It reads fine but there needs to be some consistency in labelling, highlighting, referencing, formatting |
| **Organization/Structure/Flow:** The content of the OER is presented in a logical, clear fashion. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | Two chapter labels out of sync. Table of contents looks like there are duplicate chapters or a re-hash of content. But it is because the 2nd topic is specific to the fitness assessments specific to Paramedic fitness. Adjusting the title of these chapters may help |
| **Diversity and Inclusion:** The content of the OER reflects diversity and inclusion regarding culture, gender, ethnicity, national origin, age, disability, sexual orientation, education, religion. It does not include insensitive or offensive language in these areas. Overall, how do you rate the diversity and inclusion of the text? | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | There is very little in this text that would be problematic in terms of EDI. But one contributing text does have many references to the American experience and statistics only specific to the US. |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Quality of OER Experience** | | | | | |
| **Modularity:** The OER is easily and readily divisible into smaller sections or can easily be used to support a larger educational goal allowing this OER to be flexibly adopted. The content should not be overly self-referential, and should have the potential, when adapted, to be easily reorganized and realigned. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. |  |
| **Interface:** The OER has an interface that is engaging, user friendly, and supports users with a range of technological capabilities. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | OK, but mostly flat text with little to no use of highlight textboxes or visuals to support content |
| **Multimedia Elements:** The multimedia elements in this OER are fully functioning, seamlessly integrated with the content, and is organized to enhance user experience. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | What little there is seems to work, with the exception of a few external weblinks as noted earlier. It would be nice to have more H5P content |
| **Accessibility:** The OER is designed to be accessible to all learners and educators across all the components (e.g., primary resource files, supplementary files, multimedia components where relevant). Where an accessibility standard or guideline is noted (i.e., in an accessibility statement or report), the OER fully complies with all the requirements of the standard or guideline. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER is offered in multiple ways but needs some work to meet AODA compliance |

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Addendum to Quality of OER Experience: For apps, games, software, and extended reality** | | | | | |
| **Response & control:** The OER is quickly and accurately responsive to input. For OER with XR content, the learner or educator is able to control their movement, manipulate objects, and display dexterity. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | N/A |
| **Experiential component:** The OER leverages experiential learning to engage learners in tasks that require logic and reasoning such that it enhances learning in the subject area. | | | | | |
| **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **Notes** |
| This OER does not meet any the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets a few of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets some of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER meets most of the characteristics specified in the criterion. | This OER fully meets all the characteristics specified in the criterion. | N/A |
| **Overall** | | | | | |
| **Recommendation:** Do you recommend this OER? If not, why?  Please include any other comments you would like to make about this OER, for example, its appropriateness in a Canadian/Ontario context or specific updates you think need to be made. | | | | | |
| Yes there is a lot of good content here. It can be brought up to more of Canadian/Ontario context with a bit of work, including the comments made above. | | | | | |

## **Conducting an accessibility review**

**Instructions for the reviewer:**

* Please provide honest and constructive feedback using the template below.
* Please provide the template back to the OER Editor by [*Date specified by the OER Editor*] to allow time to reflect on your feedback and implement changes.
* Please clearly identify the accessibility standard that is used for this review and provide a link where possible.

|  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Accessibility Review** | | | |
| **Reviewer Name** | Lynn Kabaroff | **Reviewer Contact** | [Lynn.kabaroff@cambriancollege.ca](mailto:Lynn.kabaroff@cambriancollege.ca) |
| **Reviewer Institutional Affiliation** | Cambrian College | **Reviewer Title** | Professor |
| **Title of OER reviewed** | **Fitness for Paramedics: A Guide for Students at Cambrian College** | | |
| **Link to OER reviewed** | [*https://openlibrary.ecampusontario.ca/item-details/#/86b82ca8-d64b-4d6a-b787-fcd1cfa5801d?k=cambrian%20college&itemTypes=6&itemTypes=12&subjects=Health%20Sciences&sortCol=2&increasePopularSearch=true*](https://openlibrary.ecampusontario.ca/item-details/#/86b82ca8-d64b-4d6a-b787-fcd1cfa5801d?k=cambrian%20college&itemTypes=6&itemTypes=12&subjects=Health%20Sciences&sortCol=2&increasePopularSearch=true) | | |
| **Accessibility standard(s) used in the review** | [Web Content Accessibility Guidelines 2.0](https://www.w3.org/TR/WCAG20/), level AA as found in the [Accessibility Toolkit - 2nd Edition](https://opentextbc.ca/accessibilitytoolkit/) | | |
| **[Technical standards]** | | | |
| **Videos: Auto Generated Captions** | No videos directly as part of resource. Some external links to videos are broken | | |
| **Ease of navigation** | Navigation through chapters is fine. Not all headings are labelled in all chapters. Labels relating to figures, references, glossary needs to be cleaned up. | | |
| **Read aloud text** | N/A | | |
| **Resolution and bandwidth allowances** | N/A | | |
| **Video content understandable for users with disabilities.** | No videos directly as part of resource. Some external links to videos are broken. Some has transcripts enabled. | | |
| **Keyboard navigation** | N/A | | |
| **Easy to download and embed on LMS** | Common cartridge download setting enabled; unclear if it is easy to embed on LMS | | |
| **Overall, does this OER pass the accessibility review based on this review?** | No | | |
| **Additional commentary on the OER** | See below | | |
| **[Editorial standards ]** | | | |
| **PDFs: Headings tagged Images alt tagged Tables tagged Flow of the document, i.e., tabbing** | Not all of the images are alt tagged. Tables are cut/pasted so are unable to be read by a screen-reader (and there is no ALT text). Tables need to be redone | | |
| **Reading language Colour contrast of text and images** | All text in black with mostly white background. Few images | | |
| **Text-based PDFs, (no images pasted)** | Some images/charts pasted | | |
| **Easy to download and embed on LMS.** | Common cartridge download setting enabled; unclear if it is easy to embed on LMS | | |
| **Overall, does this OER pass the accessibility review based on this review?** | unsure | | |
| **Additional commentary on the OER** | As only a content creator and content expert I’m unsure if I’ve caught all accessibility issues, and some I do not have the resources to assess. But the ones of the tables and navigation I’d like to fix | | |